MARKET SYSTEMS APPROACHES TO BETTER URBAN EMPLOYMENT

DCED/BEAM GLOBAL SEMINAR
February 2018
SESSION OUTLINE

• Introduction
  • Steve Hartrich (ILO, the Lab)

• Market systems and job quality: What do we know?
  • Raksha Vasudevan (MarketShare Associates)

• Carving out a new approach for better jobs in wooden furniture in Peru
  • Callie Ham (ILO, the Lab)

• Youth Employee Retention in Mombasa's Micro-Retail Sector (Kuza)
  • Leanne Rasmussen (Independent Consultant)
In what region of the world are you based?

- Europe: 34%
- Sub Saharan Africa: 42%
- Australasia: 14%
- Latin America/Caribbean: 6%
- MENA: 2%
- North America: 1%

Audience Survey: 97
What type of programmes do you most commonly work in?

- **Urban**
  - Low (focus)
  - High (focus)

- **Rural**
  - Low (focus)
  - High (focus)

**Audience Survey**

- 1 MSD/PSD projects
- 2 Donor
- 3 Other

Go to [www.menti.com](http://www.menti.com) and use the code 14318
Objective
Global knowledge generation initiative that promotes use of the market systems approach to address decent work.

How are we doing this?
Collaborating with field projects and conducting research to develop practical practitioner examples and guidance. Flagship publications, briefs, studies, gamification.
WE ARE FINDING THAT...

- Agriculture sectors covered quite extensively in MSD/PSD programming
- Less comprehensive knowledge on addressing working conditions in non-ag sectors where decent work deficits are different from those on the farm
Urbanisation, youth and job quality

- Rapid urbanisation increasing demand for off-farm work – particularly for youth – in developing countries
- 90% of global urbanisation forecast in Africa and Asia by 2050
- Youth more likely to be unemployed, working in poverty/extreme poverty and in poorer quality jobs

Source: UN World Urbanization Prospects (2014)
The shifting nature of employment

% Change share of employment 2005-2015, Asia & Pacific

Are we ready for what the future brings?

- Practitioners craving evidence that shows (how) a market systems approach can address working conditions
- Research and cases studies emerging that are looking at job quality in the urban setting (and often for youth)
- So, let’s find out what we know about market systems and job quality, and what can we do about it!
Using a Market Systems Approach to Improve Job Quality: Evidence and Impacts

Research conducted by Raksha Vasudevan & Ben Fowler of MarketShare Associates (MSA)
What is job quality?

Quality of employment

1. Safety and ethics of employment
2. Income and benefits from employment
3. Working hours and balancing work and non-working life
4. Security of employment and social protection
5. Social dialogue
6. Skills development and training
7. Workplace relationships and work motivation

Source: ILO. Small and medium-sized enterprises and decent and productive employment creation report. International Labour Conference, 104th Session. 2015
Objectives & Methodology

• Which of the 7 JQ aspects has MSD addressed? How? What have the impacts been? How strong is the evidence base?

• Initial list of 100+ MSD/‘MSD-esque’ projects → 18 selected for further review

• Criteria:
  1. Applying the principles of a MSD approach
  2. Sector diversity (beyond agriculture, including urban contexts)
  3. Focused on working conditions beyond job creation & income improvement
VOTE: Aside from JQ #2, which of these have been most commonly addressed by MSD projects?

1. Safety and ethics of employment
2. Income and benefits from employment
3. Working hours and balancing work and non-working life
4. Security of employment and social protection
5. Social dialogue
6. Skills development and training
7. Workplace relationships and work motivation

Quality of employment
Which two elements have been most commonly addressed by MSD projects?

- Safety and Ethics: 25
- Working hours & balance work/non-work: 16
- Security of employment and social protection: 28
- Social dialogue: 14
- Skills development/training: 83
- Workplace relationships/motivation: 12
Finding 1: MSD projects have prioritized certain working conditions

1) Safety and ethics of employment
2) Income and benefits
3) Working time and work-life balance
4) Security of employment and social protection
5) Social dialogue
6) Skills development and training
7) Employment-related relationships and work motivation
Finding 2: the strength of evidence for MSD’s impacts on job quality is mostly positive, but limited.

Number of Projects Reviewed

1) Safety and ethics: 14
2) Income and benefits: 13
3) Working time & work-life balance: 7
4) Security of employment & social protection: 6
5) Social dialogue: 5
6) Skills development & training: 10
7) Employment-related relationships & motivation: 5
Finding 3: A few strategies have been effective at addressing job quality

- Select the ‘right’ sectors to target

- Work at multiple levels of the system, on both demand and supply sides

- Build the business case for job quality

- Work with government institutions to change the rules around ‘decent work’

- Build adaptive management into project design
Other key success factors for addressing job quality

• Clarify the priorities for target groups
• Think about unintended consequences
• Flexibility around sector & strategy
• Longer implementation timelines
Want more information?

**Brief** (6 pages) and **full report** (60 pages) available on the ILO website

For further information contact:

Ben Fowler
MarketShare Associates
ben@marketshareassociates.com

Raksha Vasudevan
MarketShare Associates
raksha@marketshareassociates.com
Next steps in understanding job quality?

- **Job Measurement & Implementation Support (JMIS)**
  - 2-year DFID project to better measure, aggregate and communicate its impacts on job creation

- **Research on gaps identified through this study?**
JOb QUALITY IN MARKET SYSTEMS DEVELOPMENT: A CASE FROM PERU
In market development, what should be the priority?

- Creating jobs. Quality can come later. 28
- Improving jobs. It’s better to improve the quality of existing jobs 5
- Creating jobs, but only with certain quality standards. 19
Why care about job quality?

**ILO Mandate**: to advance opportunities for women and men to obtain decent and productive work in conditions of freedom, equity, security and human dignity

“It is not necessarily that the poorest people are excluded [from labor markets] but rather that they are adversely included”

-Chronic Poverty Advisory Network blog post, May 2014
Action-research in Peru’s wood & furniture sector
What is decent work / job quality?

1. Safety and ethics of employment
2. Income and benefits from employment
3. Working hours and balancing work and non-working life
4. Security of employment and social protection
5. Social dialogue
6. Skills development and training
7. Workplace relationships and work motivation

Quality of employment
A systems approach to job quality

Who are the poor and which markets matter?

Opportunity to grow markets?
Feasible to change markets?

Which DW deficits are most important?

Opportunity for ‘win-win’ outcomes?
Feasible to address DW deficits?
WHAT IS DECENT WORK / JOB QUALITY?

1. Safety and ethics of employment
2. Income and benefits from employment
3. Working hours and balancing work and non-working life
4. Security of employment and social protection
5. Social dialogue
6. Skills development and training
7. Workplace relationships and work motivation

Quality of employment
Identifying constraints to tackle

Wooden Furniture Market System Diagram

Supporting functions:
- Skills
- Technology

Core Market:
- Extraction
- Processing
- Manufacturing
- Wholesale
- Consumption

Rules & regulations:
- Consumer Preference
- Policies
- Social norms

Inputs:
- Access to markets
- Infrastructures

Outputs:
- Information
- Finance

Regulation:
- Enforcement/Compliance
A SYSTEMS APPROACH TO JOB QUALITY

**Condition:**
High labor turnover and scarce availability of formal contracts

**Intervention:**
Embed skills certification, jobs matching, and information services into current service offer

**Win-win:**
- Greater hiring confidence $\Rightarrow$ better terms of employment for workers
- Reduced turnover $\Rightarrow$ increased productivity
A SYSTEMS APPROACH TO JOB QUALITY

Condition:
Forestry and sawmill plants are extremely hazardous, with workers unprotected

Intervention:
Timber concession discount scheme gives financial incentive to employers to invest in working conditions

Win-win:
- Improved OSH
- Reduced operational costs of firms → higher returns
A systems approach to job quality

In conclusion…

✓ A systems approach to job quality is not all that different

✓ Understand the incentives linked to job quality and look for win-win solutions

✓ Show that good working conditions can be good for business and growth
Employment & Employee Retention in Mombasa’s Micro-Retail Sector:
LESSONS IN PROMOTING QUALITY OF WORK

Leanne Rasmussen
The context

- Mombasa has 44% (or more) youth unemployment rate
- Sector selection focused on low barriers to entry for unskilled youth
- Micro-Retail: retailers of FMCGs expand their distribution through sales agents (‘micro-distributors’) 
- Compensation commensurate with other sectors like hospitality
- Yet most workers left within less than a month, and micro-distributors could not fill open positions

Why?
The hypotheses

1. Social purpose
2. Opportunity to manage and make decisions
3. Frequency of pay
4. Fair, transparent commission
5. Amount of pay
6. Number of hours

**VOTE:** Which **two factors** had the biggest impact on recruitment and retention?
Which two factors had the biggest impact on recruitment and retention?

- Social purpose: 10
- Opportunity to manage and make decisions: 19
- Frequency of pay: 39
- Fair, transparent commission: 25
- Amount of pay: 34
- Number of hours: 27

Go to www.menti.com and use the code 14 31 8
The hypotheses

1. Social purpose
2. Opportunity to manage and make decisions
3. Frequency of pay
4. Fair, transparent commission
5. Amount of pay
6. Number of hours
The experiments

Frequency and structure of pay:

1. Daily pay
2. Weekly pay
3. Daily commission
4. Daily commission + salary
5. Loan

Type of Micro-Distributor:

1. Independent micro-distribution entrepreneur
2. Youth Group micro-distributor
The results

None of the changes in pay frequency made a difference.

1. Social purpose
2. Opportunity to manage and make decisions
3. Frequency of pay
4. Fair, transparent commission
The observations

Youth groups retained sales agents **regardless of the pay structure**

One micro-distributor was more successful than all others in recruitment and retention

From further qualitative interviews…

1. Social purpose
   - Less social purpose in the community, but contribution to the group was important

2. Opportunity to manage and make decisions
   - Youth strongly valued having a say in the group’s decisions

4. Fair, transparent commission
   - Youth appreciated knowing how much the distributor collected, and how much the agents collected
The implications

• **Not all jobs are created equal.** We need to pay attention to what *kinds* of jobs we are creating. This is not just about compensation.

• **Youth want to feel valued in their work.** Sense of inclusion, ability to influence decisions and ‘be heard,’ express entrepreneurial skills, etc. (Resonance with MSA’s findings)

• **Local cultural factors can create tension with these job quality factors.** In Mombasa, a traditional, strict management culture dominates. We needed to think of alternative solutions.

• **Consider – but do not force – alternative ways to do business,** especially ones where youth can be managed by other youth (or more relatable managers).

• **Think about these things early!** Talk to people, test hypotheses, and learn early on about what motivates youth.
Thanks!